

CHAPTER FORTY-SIX (*Dai yonjūroku shō* 第四十六章)

ROOT CASE¹ 【本則】

第四十六祖、丹霞淳禪師、問芙蓉曰、如何是、從上諸聖相授底一句。蓉曰、喚作一句來、幾埋沒宗風。師於言下大悟。

The Forty-sixth Ancestor, Chan Master Danxia Chun,² asked Furong:³ “What about ‘the single phrase that all the sages have passed on face-to-face up to now?’”⁴ Furong said, “To call it a ‘single phrase’ is to nearly bury our lineage style.”⁵ At these words, the Master [Zichun] greatly awakened.

¹ **Root Case** (C. *benze* 本則; J. *honsoku*). The passage given under this heading is presented as a block of Chinese text, but it is not a quotation of any known Chinese source.

² **Chan Master Danxia Chun** (C. Danxia Chun Chanshi 丹霞淳禪師; J. Tanka Jun Zenji). Danxia Zichun 丹霞子淳 (J. Tanka Shijun; 1064–1117).

³ **Furong** 芙蓉 (J. Fuyō). Furong Daokai 芙蓉道楷 (J. Fuyō Dōkai; 1043–1118), the Forty-fifth Ancestor in the Sōtō Lineage according to the *Denkōroku*.

⁴ “What about ‘the single phrase that all the sages have passed on face-to-face up to now?’” (C. *ruhe shi, congshan zhongsheng di xiangshou yiju* 如何是、從上諸聖相授底一句; J. *ika naru ka kore, jūjō no shoshō no sōju tei no ikku* 如何なるかはれ、從上の諸聖の相授底の一句). The grammar of this sentence suggests that Danxia did not formulate this question on his own, but rather raised an already existing saying (“the single phrase... etc.”) as a topic for his teacher, Furong Daokai, to comment on. However, digital search of the Chinese Buddhist canon does not find that saying, or any other that closely approximates it. A somewhat similar saying raised as a *kōan* in the *Extensive Record of Chan Master Yunmen Kuangzhen* reads:

What about “the single phrase that is transmitted separately apart from the teachings?”

《雲門匡真禪師廣錄》如何是教外別傳一句。(T 1988.47.558a5-6).

⁵ “To call it a ‘single phrase’ is to nearly bury our lineage style” (C. *huanzuo yiju lai, ji maimo zongfeng* 喚作一句來、幾埋沒宗風; J. *yonde ikku to nashi kitareba, ikubaku ka shufu wo maibotsu sen* 喚んで一句と作し來れば、幾くか宗風を埋沒せん). This line of Chinese text is very similar to one that appears in the *Collated Essentials of the Five Flame Records* under the heading “Chan Master Furong Daokai of Tianning Monastery in the Eastern Capital [Kaifeng]”:

At a convocation in the dharma hall [Furong Daokai said], “To call it a single phrase is for our lineage style to be buried already.”

《五燈會元》上堂。喚作一句。已是埋沒宗風。(CBETA, X80, no. 1565, p. 291, c18-19 // Z 2B:11, p. 265, a15-16 // R138, p. 529, a15-16).

In this context, Daokai’s remark is not explicitly framed as a response to a question, but it sounds more like a response than the broaching of a new topic.

PIVOTAL CIRCUMSTANCES 【機縁】

師諱は子淳。

The Master's personal name was Zichun.

劍州賈氏の子なり。弱冠にして出家し、芙蓉の室に徹證す。

He was a son of the Jia Clan¹ in Jianzhou Prefecture. He went forth from household life when he was young and just capped.² In Furong's room, he thoroughly verified [the truth].

初め雪峰に住し、後に丹霞に住す。

Initially he served as abbot at Xuefeng Monastery.³ Later he served as abbot at Danxia Monastery.

INVESTIGATION 【拈提】

其最初の咨問に曰く、如何なるかはれ、從上諸聖の相授底の一句と。佛佛祖祖、換面回頭し來れども、必ず背面なく上下なく、邊表なく自他なく相授底あり。之を喚で不空の空と名く。即ち是れ諸人實歸の處なり。箇箇悉く具足圓滿せずといふことなし。

With his very first question he [Zichun] asked, "What about 'the single phrase that all the sages have passed on face-to-face up to now?'" Although buddha after buddha and ancestor after ancestor have been "changing faces and turning their heads,"⁴ there is certainly something passed on face-to-

¹ He was a son of the Jia Clan (*Kashi no ko nari* 賈氏の子なり). The block of text that begins with these words is a Japanese transcription (*yomikudashi* 読み下し) of an identical Chinese passage that appears in the *Collated Essentials of the Five Flame Records* under the heading "Chan Master Danxia Zichun of Dengzhou":

《五燈會元》劍州賈氏子。弱冠爲僧。徹證於芙蓉之室。(CBETA, X80, no. 1565, p. 294, b4-5 // Z 2B:11, p. 267, c13-14 // R138, p. 534, a13-14).

² young and just capped (C. *ruoguan* 弱冠; J. *jakkan*). Having just undergone the coming-of-age ceremony of "capping" (C. *guan* 冠; J. *kan*) at twenty years of age.

³ he served as abbot at Xuefeng Monastery (*Seppō ni jū shi* 雪峰に住し). This assertion is unique to the *Denkōroku*; it is not corroborated by any other sources. Moreover, the Kenkon'in manuscript of the *Denkōroku* refers to Zichun by the otherwise unknown designation of "Reverend Chun of Xuefeng" (C. Xuefeng Chun Heshang 雪峰淳和尚; J. Seppō Jun Oshō), not as "Chan Master Chun of Danxia" (C. Danxia Chun Chan-shi 丹霞淳禪師; J. Tanka Jun Zenji). The origins of this association of Zichun with Xuefeng is unknown. It is possible that a different version of Zichun's biography once existed and is now lost. Or, perhaps the text of the *Denkōroku* is mistaken or corrupt. This question awaits new evidence.

⁴ "changing faces and turning their heads" (*kanmen kaitō* 換面回頭). For a discussion of the many possible meanings of this saying, which has been subjected to wildly

face that has no back or front, has no up or down, has no borders or surface, and has no self or other. When this is named, it is called “emptiness that is not empty.” This is the place of true refuge for all of you. Not a single one of you is not *fully equipped, complete and full*.

然るを學者多く錯りて本來無物と思ひ、更に口に言ふべきことなく、心に存すべきことなしと。夫れ是の如くなるを名て古人落空亡の外道とす。塵沙劫を経ると雖も、都て解脱の分なし。

However, many students mistakenly think that, because “from the start, there are no things,” beyond this there is nothing that should be said, and nothing that should be borne in mind. The ancients called those who are like this “followers of other paths who are lost in a mistaken view of emptiness.” Even if they pass through kalpas as numerous as motes of dust and sand, through it all they lack the capacity for liberation.

故に精細綿密にして、須らく一切皆盡て空空なりと雖も、更に空ずること得ざる底の物あり。子細に參徹して、若し一度覷得破せば、必ず一句を弄し得て通じ來ることあらん。故に相授底の一句と謂ふ。

Thus, even when “everything is entirely exhausted” and that very emptiness is empty, if you are attentive and thorough you will surely see that, in addition, there is a *thing* that cannot be regarded as empty. Thoroughly investigating in detail, if you once are able to glimpse it and break through, then you will certainly be “able to play with a single phrase” and will begin to communicate it freely. That is why it is called the “single phrase that is passed on face-to-face.”¹

時に芙蓉示して曰く、喚で一句と作し來らば幾く宗風を埋没せんと。實に是れ這箇の田地喚で一句とすべきに非ず。錯て名言を下す。雪上に鳥跡あるに似たり。故に謂ふ、藏身の處に跡なしと。

At the time, Furog instructed him [Zichun], saying, “To call it a ‘single phrase’ is to nearly bury our lineage style.” Truly, from this standpoint, it should not be called a “single phrase.” That is to erroneously append names and words, which resemble bird tracks on the snow. Thus the saying: “There are no traces in the place where you conceal yourself.”²

differing interpretations by modern scholars, → “change faces and turn the head.” In the present context, it most likely refers to the fact that the Chan/Zen Lineage of buddhas and ancestors is made up of individuals who are born and die in accordance with their own unique karma.

1 “single phrase that is passed on face-to-face” (*sōju tei no ikku* 相授底の一句). This is a quotation of the Root Case that appears at the start of this chapter.

2 “There are no traces in the place where you conceal yourself” (*zōshin no tokoro ni ato nashi* 藏身の處に跡なし). This recalls a saying attributed to Chuanzi Decheng 船子德誠

實に見聞覺知悉く息み、皮肉骨髓皆盡て後、更に何物の跡とすべきかあらん。若し能く一毫髪も跡を爲さざれば、果然として顯はれ来る。他の知る所に非ず。故に相授るの處に非ず。然れども此田地會得する時、喚で以心傳心と謂ふ。此時是れ君臣道合すと謂ふ。妙叶兼帶なり。

Truly, after seeing, hearing, perceiving, and knowing entirely subside, and skin, flesh, bones, and marrow are all exhausted, what further thing could possibly be regarded as a “trace”? If you are able to avoid creating even a single hair’s-breadth of a trace, then, sure enough, it will appear. It is not anything known by others. Thus, it is not an object that is passed on face-to-face. Nevertheless, when you are able to understand this standpoint, this is called “transmission of mind by means of mind.” The time when this happens is called “the ruler and his ministers talking together.” It is the sublime harmony of “both conjoined.”²

(J. Sensu Tokujō; d.u.) in Chapter 8 of the *Denkōroku*:

“You must leave no traces in the place where you conceal yourself, but must not conceal yourself in a place that has no traces. In my thirty years of residing at Mount Yao, I have clarified this affair only.”

直に須らく身を藏す處蹤跡なく、蹤跡なき處、身を藏すことなかるべし。吾れ三十年藥山に在て祇だ斯事を明らかにす。

For the Chinese original and English translation of the full context of this saying, → *Chuanzi Decheng*.

¹ “the ruler and his ministers talking together” (C. *junchen daohe* 君臣道合; J. *kunshin dōgō*). This expression is a quotation of Caoshan Benji’s (J. Sōzan Honjaku; 840–890) explanation of the “deep meaning of the five positions of ruler and ministers” (C. *wuwei junchen zhijue* 五位君臣旨訣; J. *goi kunshin shiketsu*), which appears in the *Discourse Record of Chan Master Yuanzheng of Mount Cao in Muzhou*:

The “ruler” represents the position of “upright.” The “ministers” represent the position of “inclined.” The ministers approaching the ruler is the “upright within the inclined.” The ruler observing the ministers is the “inclined within the upright.” The ruler and the ministers talking together is what is spoken of as “both conjoined.”

《撫州曹山元證禪師語錄》君爲正位。臣爲偏位。臣向君是偏中正。君視臣是正中偏。君臣道合是兼帶語。(T 1987A.47.527a10-12).

For the full context in which this passage appears and a discussion of the meaning of the terms “inclined” (C. *pian* 偏; J. *hen*) and “upright” (C. *zheng* 正; J. *shō*), → *five positions of inclined and upright*. In the formula of the five positions, the fifth and highest position is “inclined and upright both conjoined” (C. *pianzheng yu jiandai* 偏正與兼帶; J. *henshō yo kentai*); Caoshan uses the expression “the ruler and his ministers talking together” as a metaphor for that position, which represents full awakening.

² “both conjoined” (C. *jiandai* 兼帶; J. *kentai*). Short for “inclined and upright both conjoined” (C. *pianzheng yu jiandai* 偏正與兼帶; J. *henshō yo kentai*), the fifth and highest of the “five positions.” For details, see the previous note.

且く道へ、此田地如何なる形段なりとかせん。

Now then, speak! What might I say about the contours of *this standpoint*?

VERSE ON THE OLD CASE 【頌古】

清風數匝縱搖地。誰把將來爲汝看。

A fresh wind frequently circulates, freely sweeping the earth;
but who grasps it and brings it for you to see?